
Σ Χ Ο Λ Η

ANCIENT PHILOSOPHY AND
THE CLASSICAL TRADITION

VOLUME 8

ISSUE 1

2014

THE PLATONIC TRADITION

ΣΧΟΛΗ (Schole)

A JOURNAL OF THE CENTRE FOR ANCIENT PHILOSOPHY AND THE CLASSICAL TRADITION

Editor-in-Chief

Eugene V. Afonasin

Executive Secretary

Anna S. Afonasina

Editorial Board

Leonidas Bargeliotes (Athens–Ancient Olympia), Igor V. Berestov (Novosibirsk),
Vasily P. Goran (Novosibirsk), John Dillon (Dublin), Svetlana V. Mesyats (Moscow),
Eugene V. Orlov (Novosibirsk), Vadim B. Prozorov (Moscow), Andrei I. Schetnikov
(Novosibirsk), Alexey V. Tzyb (St. Petersburg), Marina N. Wolf (Novosibirsk)

Advisory Committee

Sergey S. Avanesov (Tomsk), Luc Brisson (Paris), Levan Gigineishvili
(Tbilisi), Vladimir S. Diev (Novosibirsk), Dominic O'Meara (Friburg), Sergey P.
Shevtsov (Odessa), Teun Tieleman (Utrecht), Vitaly V. Tselitshev (Novosibirsk)

Established at

Novosibirsk State University
Institute of Philosophy and Law (Novosibirsk, Russia)

The journal is published twice a year since March 2007

*Preparation of this volume is supported by
The “Open Society Institute” (Budapest)*

The address for correspondence

Philosophy Department, Novosibirsk State University,
Pirogov Street, 2, Novosibirsk, 630090, Russia
E-mail address: afonasin@gmail.com

On-line version: www.nsu.ru/classics/schole/

ISSN 1995-4328 (Print)
ISSN 1995-4336 (Online)

© The Center for Ancient Philosophy and
the Classical Tradition, 2014

СОДЕРЖАНИЕ / CONTENTS

ТРАДИЦИЯ ПЛАТОНИЗМА / THE PLATONIC TRADITION

ПРЕДИСЛОВИЕ РЕДАКТОРА / EDITORIAL	7
СТАТЬИ / ARTICLES	
The Houses of Philosophical Schools in Athens	9
EUGENE AFONASIN & ANNA AFONASINA	
The Beauty of the World in Plato's <i>Timaeus</i>	24
DOMINIC O'MEARA	
Damascius and the Practice of the Philosophical Life: on the Impossibility of Communication about and Communion with the First Principles	34
ANDRONIKI KALOGIRATOU	
Predestination and Essenism	50
IGOR TANTLEVSKIJ & ROMAN SVETLOV	
«Ессеи как пифагорейцы»: предестинация в пифагореизме, платонизме и кумранской теологии	54
И. Р. ТАНТЛЕВСКИЙ, Р. В. СВЕТЛОВ	
Time and Eternity from Plotinus and Boethius to Einstein	67
MICHAEL CHASE	
Taking the Strict Account of <i>Techne</i> Seriously: An Interpretive Direction in Plato's <i>Republic</i>	111
KENNETH KNIES	
Актуальность идей Прокла Диадоха в современной культуре	126
С. Б. КУЛИКОВ	
АННОТАЦИИ / ABSTRACTS	136

EDITORIAL

The first issue of the eighth volume of the journal is dedicated to the Platonic Tradition and, especially, the great Platonist Proclus (February 7/8, 412 – April 17, 485). It contains an illustrated study of the Athenian school of Platonism and a series of articles, dedicated to various aspects of Platonism from Socratic method in the *Republic* and the concept of beauty in the *Timaeus* to Damascius' metaphysics, time and eternity in Plotinus and Boethius and the platonic origins of the idea of predestination in Hellenistic Jewish philosophy.

In the second issue we continue to study the tradition of Platonism, its sources and developing in later philosophy. Studies, dedicated to the history of law and political thought in Antiquity and Early Middle Ages, form a special section. The volume is supplemented with reviews and annotations.

Our next thematic issue (January 2014) will be dedicated to natural sciences in Antiquity. Studies and translations are due by November 2014. Interested persons are welcome to contribute.

I wish to express my gratitude to all those friends and colleagues who participate in our collective projects and seminars and would like to remind that the journal is abstracted / indexed in *The Philosopher's Index* and *SCOPUS*, wherefore the prospective authors are kindly requested to supply their contributions with substantial abstracts and the lists of keywords. All the issues of the journal are available online at the following addresses: www.nsu.ru/classics/schole/ (journal's home page); www.elibrary.ru (Russian Index of Scientific Quotations); and www.ceeol.com (Central and Eastern European Online Library).

Eugene Afonasin
Academgorodok, Russia
December 25, 2013
afonasin@gmail.com

ABSTRACTS

ANNA AFONASINA & EUGENE AFONASIN

The Centre for Ancient philosophy and the Classical Tradition,
Novosibirsk State University, Institute of Philosophy and Law, Russia, afonasin@gmail.com

THE HOUSES OF PHILOSOPHICAL SCHOOLS IN ATHENS

LANGUAGE: English

ISSUE: ΣΧΟΛΗ 8.1 (2014) 9–23

KEYWORDS: Academy at Athens, Proclus, Damascius, Neoplatonism, classical archaeology.

ABSTRACT. In the first and second parts of the article we look at two archaeological sites excavated in the center of Athens, a building, located on the Southern slope of the Acropolis and now buried under the Dionysiou Areopagitou Street, known as House Chi, or the “House of Proclus”, and Houses A, B and C at the slope of the Areopagus overlooking the Athenian Agora. We outline and illustrate the basic finds and reexamine the principal arguments in favor of identifying these constructions as the houses of philosophical schools and, in the third part of the paper, offer a remark on religious practice in the Neoplatonic school.

DOMINIC O’MEARA

Fribourg University, Switzerland, dominic.omeara@unifr.ch

THE BEAUTY OF THE WORLD IN PLATO’S *TIMAEUS*

LANGUAGE: English

ISSUE: ΣΧΟΛΗ 8.1 (2014) 24–33

KEYWORDS: Aesthetics, Antiquity, harmony, the beautiful and the good, *kalos kagathos*.

ABSTRACT: In the *Timaeus* Plato describes the world as the ‘most beautiful’ (*kallistos*, 29a5) of generated things. Perhaps indeed this is the first systematic description of the beauty of the world. It is, at any rate, one of the most influential statements of the theme. The Stoics were deeply convinced by it and later, in the third century A.D., at a time when contempt and hate for the world were propagated by Gnostic movements, Plotinus, interpreting the *Timaeus*, would write magnificent passages on the beauty and value of the world. But what does Plato mean by the ‘beauty’ of the world? What makes the world beautiful? In this paper these questions are approached first (1) by a brief discussion of the distinction which Plato appears to make in the *Timaeus* between beauty and the good. In one passage (*Tim.* 87c) ‘measure’ seems to relate to this distinction. It is suitable then (2) to look at a section of another late work of Plato, the *Philebus*, where the themes of beauty, goodness and measure may be compared in more detail. The theme of measure then takes us back (3) to the *Timaeus*, in order to examine the role played by measure, in particular mathematical measure, in constituting the beauty of the world. I discuss in detail the way in which mathematical structures make for the beauty of soul and body in the living whole that is the world.

ΣΧΟΛΗ Vol. 8.1–2 (2014)

www.nsu.ru/classics/schole

ANDRONIKI KALOGIRATOU

Capital Product Partners L. P., Athens, niki.kalogiratou@gmail.com

DAMASCIUS AND THE PRACTICE OF THE PHILOSOPHICAL LIFE:

ON THE IMPOSSIBILITY OF COMMUNICATION ABOUT

AND COMMUNION WITH THE FIRST PRINCIPLES

LANGUAGE: English

ISSUE: ΣΧΟΛΗ 8.1 (2014) 34–49

KEYWORDS: Damascius, Late Neoplatonism, One, Ineffable, *skotos*, philosopher, theurgy, purification, soul, First Principles, theology, philosophy, contemplation.

ABSTRACT: This paper is an overview and introduction to the key elements of Damascius' philosophy. I examine the attributes and the relationship between the Ineffable, the One, and the All as the cornerstones of his theoretical system. I then investigate the role of this system of thought for Damascius and his contemporaries as a guide to the philosophical life and its repercussions for attaining the highest principles. Is contemplation possible or are other means needed, such as theurgy and purification of the soul? Does the philosopher occupy a privileged position in this system, as in the preceding Platonic tradition or is the philosopher's position different, by the experience of void and the inability to speak about and grasp the 'nothingness' of the highest principles?

IGOR R. TANTLEVSKIJ

St. Petersburg State University, Russia, tantigor@mail.wplus.net

ROMAN V. SVETLOV

St. Petersburg State University, Russia, spatha@mail.ru

PREDESTINATION AND ESSENISM

LANGUAGE: English

ISSUE: ΣΧΟΛΗ 8.1 (2014) 50–53

KEYWORDS: Judean history and ideology in Hellenistic and early Roman periods, sectarian Judaism, Essenes, Qumran community, history of ancient philosophy, Pythagoreanism, Platonism, predestination, eschatology.

ABSTRACT: The widely spread Essenes practice of the future events prediction is likely to be based on their belief in the absolute predestination. In this light the hitherto unclarified etymology of the very term Ἐσσηαῖοι / Ἐσσηνοί can be traced to the Aramaic notion חשׂא (pl. st. emph.)/resp. חשׂאין (st. abs.; sing. חשא), which is likely to be interpreted as “what man has to suffer, predestination, fortune”; this derivation appears to be relevant not only semantically, but also linguistically. The doctrine of predestination also plays the key role in religious outlook of the Qumran community, and it is considered to be one of the most fundamental arguments in favor of the Qumranites identification with the Essenes. Some Platonic-Pythagorean (not only Stoic) doctrines can be regarded as certain Hellenistic parallels to the Essenic-Qumranic conception of predestination.

IGOR R. TANTLEVSKIJ

St. Petersburg State University, Russia, tantigor@mail.wplus.net

ROMAN V. SVETLOV

St. Petersburg State University, Russia, spatha@mail.ru

THE ESSENES AS THE PYTHAGOREANS:

PREDESTINATION IN PYTHAGOREANISM, PLATONISM

AND THE QUMRAN THEOLOGY

LANGUAGE: Russian

ISSUE: ΣΧΟΛΗ 8.1 (2014) 54–66

KEYWORDS: Judean history and ideology in Hellenistic and early Roman periods, sectarian Judaism, Essenes, Qumran community, history of ancient philosophy, Pythagoreanism, Platonism, predestination, eschatology.

ABSTRACT: The widely spread Essenes practice of the future events prediction is likely to be based on their belief in the absolute predestination. In this light the hitherto unclarified etymology of the very term Ἐσσοῦντες / Ἐσσηνοί can be traced to the Aramaic notion חשיא (pl. st. emph.)/resp. חשיאין (st. abs.; sing. חשיא), which is likely to be interpreted as “what man has to suffer, predestination, fortune”; this derivation appears to be relevant not only semantically, but also linguistically. Thus the term “Essenes” can be interpreted as the “fatalists” (see e.g. Tantlevskij 2013). The doctrine of predestination also plays the key role in religious outlook of the Qumran community, and it is considered to be one of the most fundamental arguments in favor of the Qumranites identification with the Essenes. Some Platonic-Pythagorean (not only Stoic) doctrines can be regarded as certain Hellenistic parallels to the Essenic-Qumranic conception of predestination.

MICHAEL CHASE

CNRS, Paris, goya@vjf.cnrs.fr

TIME AND ETERNITY FROM PLOTINUS AND BOETHIUS TO EINSTEIN

LANGUAGE: English

ISSUE: ΣΧΟΛΗ 8.1 (2014) 67–110

KEYWORDS: Plotinus, Boethius, Einstein, Pierre Hadot, Philosophy as a way of life, Philosophy of time, Aristotle, future contingents, free will, predestination, innate ideas, Pseudo-Boethius, *De diis et praesensionibus*, necessity, Proclus, Porphyry.

ABSTRACT: This article seeks to show that the views on time and eternity of Plotinus and Boethius are analogous to those implied by the block-time perspective in contemporary philosophy of time, as implied by the mathematical physics of Einstein and Minkowski. Both Einstein and Boethius utilized their theories of time and eternity with the practical goal of providing consolation to persons in distress; this practice of *consolatio* is compared to Pierre Hadot’s studies of the “Look from Above”, of the importance of concentrating on the present moment, and his emphasis on ancient philosophy as providing therapy for the soul, instead of mere abstract speculation for its own sake. In the first part of the article, Einstein’s views are compared with those of Plotinus, and with the elucidation of Plotinus’ views provided in the Arabic *Theology of Aristotle*. The second part of the article studies Boethius’ *Consolation of Philosophy*, which, contrary to recent interpretations, is indeed a genuine consolation rather than a parody thereof. The *Consolation* shows how the study of the Neoplatonic philosophical curriculum can lead the student along the path to salvation, by awakening and elaborating his innate ideas. To illustrate this doctrine, a passage from the little-known Pseudo-Boethian treatise *De diis et praesensionibus* is studied. Finally, after a survey of Boethius’ view on fate and providence, and Aristotle’s theory of future contingents, I study Boethius’ three main arguments in favor of the reconcilability of divine omniscience and human free will: the distinction between absolute and conditional necessity, the principle that the nature of knowledge is determined by the knower, and finally the doctrine that God lives in an eternal present, seeing past, present, and future simultaneously. This last view, developed primarily from Plotinus, is once again argued to be analogous to that advocated by contemporary block-time theorists on the basis of Einsteinian relativity. God’s supratemporal vision intro-

duces no necessity into contingent events. Ultimate, objective reality, for Boethius as for Plotinus and Einstein, is atemporal, and our idea that there is a conflict between human free will and divine omniscience derives from a kind of optical illusion, caused by the fact that we cannot help but think in terms of temporality.

KENNETH KNIES

Sacred Heart University, USA, kniesk@sacredheart.edu

TAKING THE STRICT ACCOUNT OF TECHNE SERIOUSLY:
AN INTERPRETIVE DIRECTION IN PLATO'S *REPUBLIC*

LANGUAGE: English

ISSUE: ΣΧΟΛΗ 8.1 (2014) 111–125

KEYWORDS: Techne, Polis, Plato's *Republic*, Thrasymachus.

ABSTRACT: I argue that the strict account of techne agreed to by Socrates and Thrasymachus in *Republic I* provides a useful framework for addressing a central question of the dialogue as a whole: how philosophy might belong to the polis. This view depends upon three positions: 1) that Plato invites us to interpret the relationship between techne and polis outside the terms of the city-soul analogy, 2) that the strict account contributes to a compelling description of vocational work, and 3) that this description determines what Socrates means by a true polis, and thus frames the problem of philosophy's political inclusion.

SERGEY KULIKOV

Tomsk State Pedagogical University, kulikovsb@tspu.edu.ru

THE IDEAS OF PROCLUS DIADOCHUS AND THEIR RELEVANCE
TO MODERN CULTURE

LANGUAGE: Russian

ISSUE: ΣΧΟΛΗ 8.1 (2014) 126–135

KEYWORDS: Athens, Neoplatonism, Proclus, contemporary philosophy, ideology, human existence, culture.

ABSTRACT: The paper defends the thesis that Proclus Diadochus' ideas are still relevant in modern culture. It appears that the ideas of Neoplatonism as a whole and these of Proclus' in particular matter at least in some aspects of modern culture (or 'sets of ideals and norms'), such as the foundations of politics, the basic characteristics of philosophy and the fundamental aspects of understanding of the human existence. In the sphere of politics, one can note the ideas useful for creating of the non-totalitarian forms of ideology. In contemporary philosophy (esp. the phenomenological line of investigations) the Neoplatonic studies can be interpreted as one of the bases (or 'sources') of understanding of rational knowledge. The ideals of material harmony (true beauty) are essential for understanding of the human existence.

ΣΧΟΛΗ (Schole)

ANCIENT PHILOSOPHY AND THE CLASSICAL TRADITION

2014. Volume 8. Issue 1

THE PLATONIC TRADITION

Edited by Eugene V. Afonasin

Novosibirsk: State University Press, 2014. 145 p., with illustrations

ISSN 1995-4328 (Print) ISSN 1995-4336 (Online)

The first issue of the eighth volume of the journal is dedicated to the Platonic Tradition and, especially, the great Platonist Proclus (February 7/8, 412 – April 17, 485). It contains an illustrated study of the Athenian school of Platonism and a series of articles, dedicated to various aspects of Platonism from Socratic method in the *Republic* and the concept of beauty in the *Timaeus* to Damascius' metaphysics, time and eternity in Plotinus and Boethius and the platonic origins of the idea of predestination in Hellenistic Jewish philosophy.

These texts are prepared for the participants of the international school “ΤΕΧΝΗ. Theoretical Foundations of Arts, Sciences and Technology in the Greco-Roman World” (May 2013, Siberian Scientific Centre) organized by the “Centre for Ancient philosophy and the classical tradition” and sponsored by the “Open Society” Institute (Budapest).

The journal is abstracted / indexed in The Philosopher's Index and SCOPUS and available on-line at the following addresses: www.nsu.ru/classics/schole/ (journal's home page) and www.cceol.com (Central and Eastern European Online Library).

Компьютерная верстка и корректура Е. В. Афонасина
Редакционно-издательский центр НГУ,
630090, Новосибирск-90, ул. Пирогова, 2