
Σ Χ Ο Λ Η

ANCIENT PHILOSOPHY AND
THE CLASSICAL TRADITION

VOLUME 4

ISSUE 2

2010

SPECIAL ISSUE

IAMBlichus of Chalcis

ΣΧΟΛΗ

A JOURNAL OF THE CENTRE FOR ANCIENT PHILOSOPHY AND THE CLASSICAL TRADITION

Editor-in-Chief

Eugene V. Afonasin

Invited editor

José Molina (Mexico)

Executive Secretary

Anna S. Afonasina

Editorial Board

Leonidas Bargeliotes (Athens–Ancient Olympia), Igor V. Berestov (Novosibirsk),
Vasily P. Goran (Novosibirsk), John Dillon (Dublin), Svetlana V. Mesyats (Moscow),
Eugene V. Orlov (Novosibirsk), Vadim B. Prozorov (Moscow), Andrei I. Schetnikov
(Novosibirsk), Alexey V. Tzyb (St. Petersburg), Marina N. Wolf (Novosibirsk)

Advisory Committee

Sergey S. Avanesov (Tomsk), Luc Brisson (Paris), Levan Gigineishvili
(Tbilisi), Vladimir S. Diev (Novosibirsk), Dominic O'Meara (Friburg), Sergey P.
Shevtsov (Odessa), Teun Tieleman (Utrecht), Vitaly V. Tselitshev (Novosibirsk)

Established at

Novosibirsk State University
Institute of Philosophy and Law (Novosibirsk, Russia)

The journal is published twice a year since March 2007

*Preparation of this volume is supported by
The “Open Society Institute” (Budapest)*

The address for correspondence

Philosophy Department, Novosibirsk State University,
Pirogov Street, 2, Novosibirsk, 630090, Russia
E-mail address: afonasin@gmail.com

On-line version: www.nsu.ru/classics/schole/

ISSN 1995-4328 (Print)
ISSN 1995-4336 (Online)

© The Center for Ancient Philosophy and
the Classical Tradition, 2010

СОДЕРЖАНИЕ / CONTENTS

ПРЕДИСЛОВИЕ РЕДАКТОРА	208
EDITORIAL	209
СТАТЬИ / ARTICLES	
<i>Ars vitae</i> in Iamblichus and in the Stoic Seneca	210
PANOS ELIOPOULOS	
Virtues in Iamblichus and the Shift of Paradigm	220
CHARALAMPOS MAGOULAS	
Iamblichus' Path to the Ineffable	229
JOSÉ MOLINA	
Ямвлих о душе. Дополнение к переводу <i>Писем Ямвлиха</i>	239
Е. В. АФОНАСИН	
Ямвлих в Афинах	246
Е. В. АФОНАСИН	
БИБЛИОГРАФИЯ: ЯМВЛИХ ХАЛКИДСКИЙ. ИЗДАНИЯ И ПЕРЕВОДЫ /	
BIBLIOGRAPHY: IAMBlichUS OF CHALCIS. EDITIONS AND TRANSLATIONS	256
Аксиологические мотивы в поэмах Гомера	260
С. С. АВАНЕСОВ	
Гносеологический анализ возможных решений древнегреческого парадокса «Тяжбы Протагора с Эватлом»	291
А. Н. АХВЛЕДИАНИ	
Страбон против Посидония: полемика о влиянии солнца на климат	298
Д. А. ЩЕГЛОВ	
Измерение астрономических расстояний в Древней Греции	325
А. И. ЩЕТНИКОВ	
ПЕРЕВОДЫ / TRANSLATIONS	
Клеомед. Учение о круговращении небесных тел	349
А. И. ЩЕТНИКОВ, предисловие, перевод, примечания	
РЕЦЕНЗИИ / REVIEWS	416
АННОТАЦИИ	418
ABSTRACTS	422

EDITORIAL

The second issue of the fourth volume of the journal is roughly divided into two parts. The first part includes four articles presented at Iamblichus' seminar which took place in the Irish Institute of Hellenic Studies at Athens on March 8-10, 2009 and organized with the help of the Olympic Centre for Philosophy and Culture (Athens). For the program cf. <http://www.nsu.ru/classics/reset/Iamblichus-Athens-2009.pdf>. The papers discuss Iamblichus' heritage against the background of the greater Platonic and Pythagorean tradition in Late Antiquity.

The second part contains a series of studies, mostly dedicated to Ancient science, and a translation of an astronomical treatise by Cleomedes. These texts are prepared for the participants of the international school "TEXNH. Theoretical Foundations of Arts, Sciences and Technology in the Greco-Roman World" (May 2011, Siberian Scientific Centre) organized by the "Centre for Ancient philosophy and the classical tradition" and sponsored by the "Open Society" Institute (Budapest).

I wish to express my gratitude to all my friend and colleagues for participation in our seminars and would like to remind that the journal is available on-line at the following addresses: www.nsu.ru/classics/schole/ (journal's home page); www.elibrary.ru (Russian Index of Scientific Quotations); and www.cceol.com (Central and Eastern European Online Library).

Finally, please note that the postal address has been changed: all correspondence, related to the journal, should now be directed to Philosophy Department, Novosibirsk State University, Pirogov Street, 2, Novosibirsk 630090, Russia.

Eugene Afonasin (Academgorodok)

José Molina (Mexico)

Decembre 25, 2010

afonasin@gmail.com

josemolina@correo.unam.mx

ABSTRACTS

PANOS ELIOPOULOS

Olympic Centre of Philosophy and Culture, Athens, Greece

ksatriya@tri.forthnet.gr

ARS VITAE IN IAMBlichUS AND IN THE STOIC SENECA

LANGUAGE: English

ISSUE: ΣΧΟΛΗ 4.2 (2010) 210–219

KEYWORDS: wisdom, *ars vitae*, individual differences, education, volition, soul, right reason

ABSTRACT. Seneca expounds a theory of therapy and teaching with the ultimate goal of self knowledge and wisdom. Some of his techniques are based on Pythagorean principles or derive ideas from them, among them the focused and constant asceticism of self control. Iamblichus in *De Vita Pythagorica* exhibits great interest on the fact that man's inherent abilities along with the aid of proper education suffice for his attainment of wisdom. For both thinkers, knowledge through practice is considered to be one of the major philosophical demands in the perspective of an "ars vitae". The human being has to canalize himself into the modeling of a new way of living, an "art of living" which will contribute decisively to the fulfillment of his teleology, to his perpetual eudaimonia (*bene vivere*). The admittance of individual differences in people's ability to reform themselves only signifies the more intense effort of the teacher towards a purification of their intellect and greater engagement of the individuals' volition but not their inability for correction.

CHARALAMPOS MAGOULAS

Department of Sociology, National School of Public Health, Athens

magba05@yahoo.com

VIRTUES IN IAMBlichUS AND THE SHIFT OF PARADIGM

LANGUAGE: English

ISSUE: ΣΧΟΛΗ 4.2 (2010) 220–228

KEYWORDS: levels and kinds of virtues, piety, temperance, theurgy, love

ABSTRACT. This paper aims at pointing out differences between the perception of virtues in Plato's *Protagoras* and especially the *Symposium* and in Iamblichus. The argument is focused on the fact that, although both philosophers agree that virtues can be taught and they are therefore a social activity, in Plato there is a certain significance laid on the social role of virtues as well as on the cardinal importance of love as a sentiment that leads to temperance, in Iamblichus, what is more adequate for a philosopher to exercise is rather the hieratic values, while the temperance is the virtue that leads to the union with god. Based on that argument and in the fact that theurgy as a practice is more personal than social, we could possibly trace in representative philosophical thoughts of these eras the change of worldviews between classical and late antiquity, as, at any rate, the historical research shows.

JOSÉ MOLINA

Centro de Estudios Clásicos, Instituto de Investigaciones Filológicas
Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México, josemolina@correo.unam.mx

IAMBlichUS' PATH TO THE INEFFABLE

LANGUAGE: English

ISSUE: ΣΧΟΛΗ 4.2 (2010) 229–238

KEYWORDS: metaphysics, theurgy, soul, Late Platonism, Plotinus, mysticism

ABSTRACT. Iamblichus of Chalcis postulated theurgy on metaphysical grounds as the only means of communion with the supreme principle of everything that exists. Iamblichus set this principle as a completely transcendent reality, unattainable by reason, and, at the same time, differs from Plotinus, who postulated absolute withdrawal from everything and conceived union with the One as an escape in solitude to the solitary. Iamblichus conceives matter as an instrument for the soul's ascent to that principle and explicitly proposes a mysticism of solidarity with the cosmos and with other souls.

EUGENE AFONASIN

The centre for Ancient philosophy and the classical tradition,
Novosibirsk State University, Institute of philosophy and law, Russia, afonasin@gmail.com

IAMBlichUS ON THE SOUL.

A supplementary note to a Russian Translation of Iamblichus of Chalcis' *Letters*

LANGUAGE: Russian

ISSUE: ΣΧΟΛΗ 4.2 (2010) 239–245

KEYWORDS: Platonism, descend of souls, eschatology, fate, providence

ABSTRACT. The *Letters* by the Neoplatonic philosopher Iamblichus of Chalcis (c. 242–325 CE), preserved in a fragmentary form by John of Stobi in his *Antologia* and translated into Russian in the previous issue of the journal (ΣΧΟΛΗ 4. 1 (2010) 166–193), are now supplemented by two minor testimonia (by Olympiodorus and Damaskius) and a note on the descend of souls in Later Neoplatonism.

EUGENE AFONASIN

The centre for Ancient philosophy and the classical tradition,
Novosibirsk State University, Institute of philosophy and law, Russia, afonasin@gmail.com

IAMBlichUS IN ATHENS

LANGUAGE: Russian

ISSUE: ΣΧΟΛΗ 4.2 (2010) 246–255

KEYWORDS: Athenian Neoplatonism, Intellectual centers, Libanius, Himerius, Sopatros

ABSTRACT. Following earlier studies by Raubitschek 1964 and Cameron 1969 the paper reexamines literary and epigraphic evidence concerned an Athenian philosopher called Iamblichus, who apparently played an important role in the revival of interest to his famous namesake in early fifth century Athens. The paper is prepared thanks to generous support of the Onassis Foundation in Athens (winter 2008/9) and based on my talk at the conference "Iamblichus: His Sources and Influence" (Irish Institute of Hellenic Studies at Athens, March 2009).

SERGEY AVANESOV

Tomsk State University, Russia, iskiteam@yandex.ru

AXIOLOGICAL MOTIVES IN HOMER (1)

LANGUAGE: Russian

ISSUE: ΣΧΟΛΗ 4.2 (2010) 260–290

KEYWORDS: Values in archaic society, Homer, Ancient literature, epic poems

ABSTRACT. Axiology as a sphere of value orientation and preferences is a base of every culture. The analysis of Homer's poems gives an opportunity to explicate the value base of archaic Mediterranean culture. Values such as honor, glory, devotion, self-sacrifice, friendship, mutual help, hospitality, justice-equality and justice-retribution are on the positive pole of this culture. Anger, insult, deception, greed, cowardice, audacity, and desecration of the enemy's body are on the negative pole. Positive values are fixed in the sanctioned "standards" of social behavior.

ALEXANDER AKHVLEDIANY

Scientific Society «INCOL», Israel, Carmiel, alexanderakhvlediany@yandex.ru

EPISTEMOLOGICAL ANALYSIS AND POSSIBLE SOLUTIONS TO

"PROTAGORAS AND EUATHLUS PARADOX"

LANGUAGE: Russian

ISSUE: ΣΧΟΛΗ 4.2 (2010) 291–297

KEYWORDS: Paradox, formal logic, epistemology, non-formal logic, conflict resolution

ABSTRACT. According to the legendary story, Protagoras made an agreement with one of his pupils Euathlus, stipulating that the pupil was to pay for his education in law only after he had won his first case. Euathlus completed his course, but did not practice as a lawyer for a long time. Protagoras decided to sue Euathlus for the amount owed him. Protagoras argued, "Either I win this suit, or you win it". "If I win, you pay me according to the judgment of the court. If you win, you pay me according to our agreement. In either case I am bound to be paid". However, Euathlus was a resourceful person and he replied: "Not so. If I win, then by the judgment of the court I need not pay you. If you win, then by our agreement I need not pay you. In either case I am bound not to have to pay you". Whose argument was right? It turned out that, due to the formulation of the paradox, it can not be solved by classical methods of traditional formal logic, as well as by the formal zero order logic system. However, the article shows that the epistemological solution to this paradox exists, according to non-classical method of conflict resolution.

DMITRY A. SHCHEGLOV

Saint Petersburg Branch of the Institute for the History of Science and Technology,

Russian Academy of Sciences, shcheglov@yandex.ru

STRABO VS. POSIDONIUS: POLEMICS OVER SOLAR INFLUENCE ON THE CLIMATE IN F 223 EK

LANGUAGE: Russian

ISSUE: ΣΧΟΛΗ 4.2 (2010) 298–324

KEYWORDS: geography, climate, polemics, misinterpretation

ABSTRACT. Posidonius' F 223 EK has been long regarded a puzzle. In this text Strabo discusses a theory of Posidonius about the influence of the Sun on the climate. The article argues that Strabo misinterprets Posidonius' words and ascribes him egregiously absurd ideas. Accordingly, modern commentators, following Strabo, misconstrue Posidonius' theory in the

same way. The article suggests a new interpretation of this theory, which makes it possible to explain Posidonius' words and save him from false charges of absurd ideas.

ANDREY SHETNIKOV

ΣΙΓΜΑ. The Centre of Educational Projects, Novosibirsk, Russia, schetnikov@ngs.ru

MEASURING DISTANCES IN ANCIENT GREEK ASTRONOMY

LANGUAGE: Russian

ISSUE: ΣΧΟΛΗ 4.2 (2010) 325–348

KEYWORDS: Ancient science, astronomy, eclipses, measuring techniques

ABSTRACT. The article is based on a course of lectures in Ancient astronomy delivered at the international summer school “ΤΕΧΝΗ. Theoretical Foundations of Arts, Sciences and Technology in the Greco-Roman World” (August 2010, Novosibirsk) organized by the Centre for Ancient philosophy and the classical tradition and sponsored by the “Open Society Institute”. Two attachments are devoted to al-Biruni's and early modern measurements of distances to Sun and Moon.

ANDREY SHETNIKOV

ΣΙΓΜΑ. The Centre of Educational Projects, Novosibirsk, Russia, schetnikov@ngs.ru

CLEOMEDES. ON THE CIRCULAR MOTIONS OF THE CELESTIAL BODIES

Introduction, Russian translation and notes

LANGUAGE: Russian

ISSUE: ΣΧΟΛΗ 4.2 (2010) 349–415

KEYWORDS: scientific manual, Greek science, astronomy, measuring techniques

ABSTRACT. Translated into Russian for the first time, Cleomedes' On the Circular Motions of the Celestial Bodies is a basic astronomy textbook in two volumes. His author criticizes the Epicureans and approves of the Stoics. The work is valued for preserving much of Posidonius' lost writings on astronomy. Cleomedes accurately discusses lunar eclipses, notes that the absolute size of many stars may exceed that of the Sun, argues that the sun appears farther away on the horizon than in the zenith, and therefore larger (since its angular size is constant). This book is the original source for the well-known story of how Eratosthenes measured the Earth's circumference.

ΣΧΟΛΗ

ΦΙΛΟΣΟΦΙΚΟ ΑΝΤΙΚΟΛΛΕΓΙΜΟ ΚΑΙ ΚΛΑССИΚΗ ΤΡΑΔΙΤΙΑ

2010. Τομ 4. Βυπυκ 2

Νοβοσιβιρσκ: Ρεδ.-ιζδ. κεντρ Νοβοσιβ. γοσ. υν-τα, 2010. 224 σ.

ISSN 1995-4328 (Print) ISSN 1995-4336 (Online)

ΤΕΜΑ ΝΟΜΕΡΑ: ЯМВΛΙΧ ΧΑΛΚΙΔΣΚΙЙ

Β πρβυγ ραζδελ δανного βυπυκσ κλυκονο чετυρε σταγες, ποςβακшенные ιζυκονο ηα-
σλεδία Ямвлиха в шιροκο ιστορικοσ κονтексте, а также небольшая заметка, κοτο-
рая доπολλняет перевод *Πισем* сирийского неоплатоника, вошедший в предыдущий вы-
пυκσ журналa (ΣΧΟΛΗ 4.1, 166–193). Статυи σοπροκοждаются библиογραφией ιζδаний
и переводов сочинений Ямвлиха на основные европейские языки. Во второй ραζδел
вошло несколько статей, в основном по истории античной науки, а также перевод ас-
τρονομического трактата Клеομεδα, подготовленных специально для участников се-
минара по истории античной науки, κοтοрый пройдет в Сибирском научном κεντρε в
начале мая 2011 г. при поддержке Института «Открытое общество». Тексты можно
найти на собственной странице журналa www.nsu.ru/classics/schole/, а также в составе
следующих электронных библиοтек: www.elibrary.ru (Научная электронная библиοτε-
ка) и www.ceeol.com (Central and Eastern European Online Library).

ΣΧΟΛΗ

ANCIENT PHILOSOPHY AND THE CLASSICAL TRADITION

2010. Volume 4. Issue 2

Novosibirsk: State University Press, 2010. 224 p.

ISSN 1995-4328 (Print) ISSN 1995-4336 (Online)

SPECIAL ISSUE: IAMBlichus of Chalcis

The first part of the issue contains four articles presented at Iamblichus' seminar which took place in the Irish Institute of Hellenic Studies at Athens on March 8-10, 2009. The papers discuss Iamblichus' heritage against the background of the greater Platonic and Pythagorean tradition in Late Antiquity. The second part consists of a series of studies, mostly dedicated to Ancient science, and a translation of an astronomical treatise by Cleomedes. These texts are prepared for the participants of the international school "ΤΕΧΝΗ. Theoretical Foundations of Arts, Sciences and Technology in the Greco-Roman World" (May 2011, Siberian Scientific Centre) organized by the "Centre for Ancient philosophy and the classical tradition" and sponsored by the "Open Society" Institute (Budapest). The journal is available on-line at the following addresses: www.nsu.ru/classics/schole/ (journal's home page); www.elibrary.ru (Russian Index of Scientific Quotations); and www.ceeol.com (Central and Eastern European Online Library).

Κομπυτερная верстка и корректура Ε. Β. Αφονασινα

Ποδπιασано в печать 25.12.2010. Заказ №

Фορματ 70 x 108 1/16. Οφсетная печать. Уч.-ιζδ. л. 11,8

Редакционно-ιζδательский κεντρ НГУ,

630090, Новосибирск-90, ул. Пιρογοва, 2