
ΣΧΟΛΗ

ANCIENT PHILOSOPHY AND
THE CLASSICAL TRADITION

VOLUME 12

ISSUE 2

2018

ΣΧΟΛΗ (Schole)

ANCIENT PHILOSOPHY AND THE CLASSICAL TRADITION

Editor-in-Chief

Eugene V. Afonasin (Novosibirsk)

Reviews and Bibliography

Anna S. Afonasina (Novosibirsk)

Editorial Board

Igor V. Berestov (Novosibirsk), Pavel A. Butakov (Novosibirsk),
John Dillon (Dublin), Svetlana V. Mesyats (Moscow), Dominic O'Meara (Friburg), Eugene
V. Orlov (Novosibirsk), Maya S. Petrova (Moscow), Andrei I. Schetnikov (Novosibirsk),
Teun Tieleman (Utrecht), Marina N. Wolf (Novosibirsk)

Advisory Committee

Sergey S. Avanesov (Tomsk), Leonidas Bargeliotes (Athens–Ancient Olympia), Luc
Brisson (Paris), Levan Gigineishvili (Tbilisi), Vasily P. Goran (Novosibirsk), Vladimir S.
Diev (Novosibirsk), Vadim B. Prozorov (Moscow), Sergey P. Shevtsov (Odessa),
Vitaly V. Tselitshev (Novosibirsk)

Established at

Novosibirsk State University
Institute of Philosophy and Law (Novosibirsk, Russia)

The journal is published twice a year since March 2007

The address for correspondence

Philosophy Department, Novosibirsk State University,
Pirogov Street, 2, Novosibirsk, 630090, Russia

E-mail addresses:

Articles and translations: afonasin@gmail.com

Reviews and bibliography: afonasina@gmail.com

On-line version: www.nsu.ru/classics/schole/

ISSN 1995-4328 (Print)
ISSN 1995-4336 (Online)

© Aquilo Press, 2018
© The Center for Ancient Philosophy and
the Classical Tradition, 2007–2018

СОДЕРЖАНИЕ / CONTENTS

СТАТЬИ / ARTICLES

The theory and practice of torture in Ancient Athenian courts VASILEIOS ADAMIDIS	336
De poetis Lesbiorum, de herma, deo fertilitatis, et de mysteriis Artemidis apud Mytilenaeos olim celebratis TIMOTHEY MYAKIN	349
The Christ-Logos question in Amelius JOSE MARIA ZAMORA CALVO	365
The requirements of science according to Proclus the Neoplatonist CHRISTOS TEREZIS AND LYDIA PETRIDOU	380
Seneca on gratitude and justice: How to translate <i>Ep.</i> 81, 19? ANDREI SEREGIN	393
Splitting concepts: steps of reflection OLEG DONSIKH	402
Reading a woman (<i>Rep.</i> 454d) IRINA PROTOPOPOVA, ALEXEI GARADJA	426
Classical Philosophy in the <i>Homily on the Transfiguration of the Lord</i> by Andrew of Crete VLADIMIR BARANOV	433
Категория страха в эпикурейской философии (по поэме Лукреция «О природе вещей») С. С. ДЕМИНА	444
Средиземноморское побережье Африки в «Географии» Птолемея и в «Стадиасме Великого моря» Д. А. ЩЕГЛОВ	453

О философии языка Порфирия и Ямвлиха И. П. КУРДЫБАЙЛО и Д. С. КУРДЫБАЙЛО	480
О соотношении категорий <i>to lekton</i> в философии стоиков и <i>Sinn</i> в семантической теории Г. Фреге: вопрос об их эпистемологическом статусе В. А. СУРОВЦЕВ	499
Тело и пряха. Визуализация метафоры в иконографии благовещения С. С. АВАНЕСОВ	523
Императив <i>bona fides</i> и проблемы использования инвективы в политической борьбе поздней Римской республики Е. В. ДЕРЖИВИЦКИЙ, В. Ю. ПЕРОВ	535
Пирроновский скептицизм и вторая теорема Гёделя о неполноте В. В. ЦЕЛИЩЕВ	550
Атараксия в пирронизме Д. К. МАСЛОВ	561
Присвоение чужеземной учености в античной и средневековой латинской традиции В. В. ПЕТРОВ	569
Две теодицеи в философии Плотина Н. П. ВОЛКОВА	582
Учение Прокла о надкосмических душах С. В. МЕСЯЦ	599
Неостоицизм Юста Липсия и историко-философское знание в эпоху позднего Возрождения А. А. САНЖЕНАКОВ	632
Концепция естественного права: от Платона к Филону Р. В. СВЕТЛОВ, Е. В. АЛЫМОВА	643
Логическая структура эпикурейского возражения скептикам из <i>Adv. Math.</i> VIII, 337 И. В. БЕРЕСТОВ, А. В. ТИХОНОВ	659
Платон, эвиденциализм и JTB П. А. БУТАКОВ	669

ПЕРЕВОДЫ / TRANSLATIONS

- Гераклид Понтийский и философская биография 686
 Е. В. АФОНАСИН
- Гераклид Понтийский. Фрагменты и свидетельства («О болезнях, или Бездыханная», фр. 82–95 Str.) 697
 Е. В. АФОНАСИН, ПЕРЕВОД И КОММЕНТАРИЙ

РЕЦЕНЗИИ И БИБЛИОГРАФИЯ / REVIEWS AND BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Имагинативная история античной философии 705
 Ю. М. РОМАНЕНКО
- Платонизм и нормативизм: историко-философская реконструкция 709
 А. Б. ДИДИКИН
- Философия face to face. Публичные и частные пространства античной культуры 714
 Б. М. МАРКОВ
- Космология и политика в поздних работах Платона 721
 А. С. АФОНАСИНА

- АННОТАЦИИ / ABSTRACTS** 735

ABSTRACTS

Vasileios Adamidis

Nottingham Trent University, UK, Vasileios.adamidis@ntu.ac.uk

The theory and practice of torture in Ancient Athenian courts

Language: English

Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 12.2 (2018) 336–348

Keywords: Basanos (torture), Athenian law, rhetoric, Attic orators, Aristotle, Anaximenes.

Abstract. There has been much debate in scholarship over the actual existence of torture (basanos) of innocent slaves for evidentiary purposes in the courts of classical Athens in the age of the orators. In the absence of direct evidence in the forensic speeches, scholars have pointed to a putative inconsistency between theory and practice regarding this institution. On the one hand, belief in the reliability of torture is evident in the works of the Attic orators, as well as challenges to evidentiary torture. Furthermore, rhetorical theory (in Aristotle's *Rhetoric* and Anaximenes' *Rhetorica ad Alexandrum*) supposedly provides guidance to orators as if recourse to basanos was a real possibility and classifies torture under the category of artless or supplementary proofs. On the other hand, not even one of such challenges has evidently been accepted and actually carried out and the sources are silent as to the actuality of evidentiary torture. This study closely examines the evidence of the primary sources and seeks to provide a solution to the aforementioned putative inconsistency. It demonstrates that it is far from certain that Aristotle and Anaximenes referred to the particular type of evidentiary basanos, since closer analysis shows that the shape of this institution is complex and much nuanced. Moreover, the presence in the courts of testimonies elicited by other than evidentiary types of torture, points to the root of the Athenian belief in the reliability of torture. Consequently, it is plausible to suggest that by the time of the Attic orators, evidentiary basanos had become obsolete and its remnant was primarily of rhetorical value.

Timothey Myakin

Novosibirsk State University, miackin.timof@yandex.ru

About the Lesbian poets, about Hermes, the God of Fertility, and about the Mysteries of Artemis in Ancient Mytilene

Language: Latin

Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 12.2 (2018) 349–364

Keywords: poetry of Alcaeus, erotic poetry of Sappho, mysteries of Artemis in ancient Mytilene, pre-wedding rituals in Ancient Greece.

Abstract. The article finalizes the study of the erotic pre-wedding ritual of the mysteries of Artemis in ancient Mytilene. Comparative analysis of epigraphic, literary and new archaeological data shows that the Sapphic girls during this ritual seem to have sacrificed their virginity to the goddess Artemis (cf. Sapph. Fr. 99 (a–b), Fr. 114 Campbell; SEG XX 717, 84–97; IG XII (2) 255; Ps.-Aeschin. 10 etc.). In this case, the older girls in the course of

these mysteries of Artemis seem to have acted as Hermes, the phallic deity of fertility (cf. Sapph. Fr. 141, Fr. 150 Campbell; TAM III/1 35, A1). New archaeological discoveries, made in Klopedi (North Lesbos), also testify in favor of this hypothesis.

José María Zamora Calvo

Universidad Autónoma de Madrid, jm.zamora@uam.es

The Christ-logos question in Amelius

Language: English

Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 12.2 (2018) 365–379

Keywords: Amelius, Christ, Logos, Intellect, Demiurge, Neoplatonism

Abstract. The main thesis of Christians, according to which Jesus is the divine *Logos*, the Son of God, is *unacceptably* illogical for Plotinus closest disciples. The irrationality of Christian doctrine lies in having identified a unique, personal and corporal individual with the divine principle. Such a statement implies identifying God himself with something passive and irrational, which is inadmissible to Amelius and Porphyry. Amelius helps Plotinus to answer the Gnostic Christians attending the school of Plotinus. In his *Praeparatio Evangelica* (XI.19.1–8) Eusebius refers to Amelius' comment to the prologue to the Gospel of John. Unlike Numenius, for whom the demiurgic intellect, compared to Zeus, is the second cause of what comes to be, for Amelius, this second cause is the *logos*, which is the formal cause (*kath' hon*), the efficient cause (*di' hou*) and the material cause (*en hōi*) of what comes to be. Amelius links this conception of *logos* – which is being, life and thought – with Heraclitus (*DK* 22 B1) and with the prologue to the Gospel of John. Likewise, Amelius, based on the interpretation of *Timaeus* (39e7–9), established a triad of the demiurgic intellects (= the three Kings of the apocryphal *Second Letter*). In his Neoplatonic rereading, the *logos* of the beginning of the fourth Gospel has a very similar function to that performed by the world soul. On the one hand, it is the supreme cause of all the things, which come to be, and, on the other hand, redirects its energy towards the superior god from which it comes

Christos Terezis

University of Patras, Greece, terezis@upatras.gr

Lydia Petridou

Hellenic Open University, Greece, e-mail: petridou.lydia@ac.eap.gr

The requirements of science according to Proclus the Neoplatonist

Language: English

Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 12.2 (2018) 380–392

Keywords: Proclus, *Alcibiades I*, knowledge, science, counsellor.

Abstract. In this study, focusing our attention on Proclus' comments on the Platonic dialogue *Alcibiades I*, one of the greatest epistemological texts of the ancient Greek literature, we follow his attempt to show a philosophy of subject. More specifically, we investigate the terms in which science can be acquired by a thinking subject, which forms its broader existential identity utilizing its relation to knowledge, which subsequently can be used so as to the quality of a counsellor to be established too. Systematic learning and

research are methodologically considered to be the main ways for making science, while the psychological factor and the intention of the thinking subject to turn to itself in order to gradually discover the completeness that a priori possesses are also quite important. Note that this turn towards the self reaches the highest possible point with insight.

Andrei Seregin

Institute of Philosophy RAS (Moscow), avis12@yandex.ru

Seneca on gratitude and justice: how to translate *Ep.* 81, 19?

Language: English

Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 12.2 (2018) 393–401

Keywords: ancient ethics, gratitude, justice, perfectionism, virtues.

Abstract. In this paper I discuss how to translate a rather ambiguous passage in Seneca's "Letters to Lucilius" (81, 19), where he either I) opposes gratitude to justice for the reason that the former is the agent's own good and the latter regards other people's interests or, II) quite to the contrary, draws an analogy between these virtues, pointing out that both of them constitute the agent's own good. Both these alternatives seem grammatically possible and can be found in modern translations of this "Letter" into main European languages. I argue in favour of II) on the ground that it agrees better with general perfectionist approach to virtues that Seneca espouses in this context.

Oleg Donskikh

Novosibirsk State University of Economics and Management (Russia),

olegdonskikh@yandex.ru

Splitting concepts: steps of reflection

Language: English

Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 12.2 (2018) 402–425

Keywords: mythological cosmogony, genealogical metaphor, metaphor of a craftsman, general concepts, "apeiron" (apeiron), "being" (on), "nature" (physis), "logos", "destiny" (moira), "law" (themis, dike), Parmenides, Heraclitus, Sophists, Plato, Aristotle.

Abstract. The article analyzes a number of stages of the formation of a generic and non-specific vocabulary in the period from the 9–8th to the 5–4th centuries BCE in Ancient Greece. Cosmogonies of the period of ordering mythological representations in Egyptian, Phoenician and Greek cultures are taken as a source material. The article considers the interaction of basic metaphors that allow this ordering to be carried out—metaphors of genealogical (birth and change of generations) and metaphors of artisan-demiurge. The formation of the legislative space is investigated, yet namely this space allows to outline the first reflective steps in relation to mythological thinking. These steps are initially carried out within the limits of traditional mythological images. The most important stage of the movement towards general words in the process of the emergence of artificial concepts in the early philosophical systems – "apeiron", "on", "logos", "physis", which begin to be ordered through interaction with each other. In parallel with the personified mythological concepts the abstract concepts are gradually lining up and organizing systematically. From the beginning they allow to integrate mythological ideas and present

them in the abstract form. In the next phase, a fundamental role is played by the activity of sophists, whose attention is focused on the game with the general concepts, yet the content of these concepts starts to lose the reference to the outside world. At the same time, the language is discovered as an independent system. This is the content of the third stage of reflective activity. The attempt of Socrates to escape from sophistic relativism and return the contents to the general concepts leads to the overturning of the relations of names and reality, when it turns out that the general concepts are enclosed in the soul, and they are preset the understanding of the world. Plato and Aristotle implement this setting and transform this work with concepts into a separate sphere of activity, creating dialectics and logic that underlie the methodology of reasoning and research in different spheres of intellectual activity.

Irina Protopopova (plotinus70@gmail.com), Alexei Garadja (agaradja@yandex.ru)
The Russian State University for the Humanities (Moscow)

Reading a Woman (*Republic* 454d)

Language: English

Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 12.2 (2018) 426–432

Keywords: Plato, the *Republic*, female doctor, *physis* and *eidōs*.

Abstract. The article analyzes a passage from Plato's *Republic* that has long since caused confusion and debate amongst editors and translators: οἷον ἰατρικὸν μὲν καὶ ἰατρικὴν τὴν ψυχὴν [δὲ] τὴν αὐτὴν φύσιν ἔχειν ἐλέγομεν· ἢ οὐκ οἶε; (R. 454d1–3 Burnet). Can ἰατρικὴ τὴν ψυχὴν translate as 'capable of healing psychically' and refer to a female doctor, or is this passage "hopelessly corrupt" (Slings), the feminine flexion in ἰατρικὴ only putting the reader off the track? The authors give a brief summary of the readings and emendations proposed by various editors and commentators, and offer their own interpretation of the passage guided by its *philosophical* context, relying on Plato's redefinition of *physis* and his sustained attention to the *eidōs* of the different and the identical, τῆς ἐτέρας and τῆς αὐτῆς φύσεως (R. 453b5–456a4). The phrase about "doctor and doctor *in soul*" fits into this context only if we consider these "doctors" opposites in the physical sense and correlatives socially. From this perspective, it makes sense to read ἰατρικὸν μὲν καὶ ἰατρικὴν τὴν ψυχὴν as the correlation of the different (male and female) *within* the identical (aptitude for healing).

Vladimir Baranov

Novosibirsk State University of Architecture, Design and Fine Art, baranovv@academ.org
Classical Philosophy in the *Homily on the Transfiguration of the Lord* by Andrew of Crete

Language: English

Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 12.2 (2018) 433–443

Keywords: Andrew of Crete, Transfiguration, Plato, Unmoved Mover, numerology, Philo of Alexandria.

Abstract. In his *Homily on the Transfiguration*, Andrew of Crete (ca. 660–740) employs a number of concepts, metaphors, and expressions from classical philosophy, including

the dialogues of Plato, Aristotle's concept of the unmoved mover, and symbolic arithmology of the Neopythagoreans, known to Andrew by mediation of Philo of Alexandria.

Svetlana Demina

Vladimir State University named after Alexander and Nikolay Stoletovs, Russia

The category of fear in the Epicurean Philosophy (based on Lucretius' poem

De rerum natura)

Language: Russian

Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 12.2 (2018) 444–452

Keywords: Ancient philosophy, Epicureanism, Epicureans, Ancient Rome, Lucretius, fear.

Abstract. The article investigates Epicureans' thoughts about fear based on the analysis of Lucretius' poem «On the Nature of Things». He uses the terms *timor*, *metus*, *terror*, *formido*, *pavor*. The category of fear is important for Lucretius, because it allows him to elucidate the fundamentals of the Epicurean philosophy. With its help he displays the differences of characters, the similarity of the human race and animals on the emotional level, explains the aim of life in Epicurus' conception, describes people's attitude towards gods, natural phenomena, death, characterizes vices, violations of all norms, asserts the inevitability of punishments for them by people, not gods. Lucretius displays the correlation between various fears, which is based on erroneous thoughts of people about death and nature of things. He calls to fight against fears with help of the Epicurean doctrine, but thinks that the philosophy is not able to completely eradicate the demerits (predisposition to fear, anger, and indifference).

Dmitry A. Shcheglov

Saint Petersburg Branch of the S.I. Vavilov Institute for the History of Science

and Technology, shcheglov@yandex.ru

The Mediterranean coast of Africa in Ptolemy's *Geography* and in the *Stadiasmus of the Great Sea*

Language: Russian

Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 12.2 (2018) 453–479

Keywords: ancient geography, ancient cartography, periploi, Claudius Ptolemy, Ptolemy's *Geography*, Ptolemy's map, Stadiasmus of the Great Sea, the circumference of the Earth, the length of the stade.

Abstract. The paper argues that the depiction of the Mediterranean coast of Africa in Ptolemy's *Geography* was based on a source similar to the *Stadiasmus of the Great Sea*. Ptolemy's and the *Stadiasmus*' toponymy and distances between major points are mostly in good agreement. Ptolemy's place names overlap with those of the *Stadiasmus* by 80%, and the total length of the coastline from Alexandria to Utica on Ptolemy's map deviates from the *Stadiasmus* data by only 1% or 1.5% (in different recensions). A number of serious disagreements between Ptolemy's map and the *Stadiasmus* regarding the length of particular coastal stretches can be explained by assuming that Ptolemy had to tailor the distance data derived from *periploi* to his other sources, especially, to the longitudes of

the key reference points, such as Cape Phycas, Cyrena, Berenice, Aesporis (Eperos), Thenna, and Carthage. A notable stretching and the subsequent contraction of the coast between Alexandria and Cyrenaica, as are exhibited by Ptolemy's map relative to the *Stadiasmus*' data, can be explained by assuming that several points on this coast were tied to the position of Crete, which was moved to the west being pushed by the westward shift of Rhodes. A sharp contraction of the two coastal stretches of the Great Sirte, oriented along the north-south direction, can be explained by Ptolemy's erroneously underestimated value for the circumference of the Earth. The analysis of this contraction, as well as of the east-west stretching of the coast between Alexandria and Cyrene in angular terms relative to the modern map, makes it possible to assess the magnitude of Ptolemy's error and to determine the length of his stade. This analysis shows that Ptolemy's value for the circumference of the Earth must have been underestimated by approximately 20–27%, and Ptolemy's stade must have been approximately 175–185 m length. Comparison of the *Stadiasmus* distance data with the modern map shows that the average length of the stade was close to 179 m or to the “common” stade of 185 m for the stretch between Alexandria and Berenice.

Inga Kurdybaylo

Saint-Petersburg State University of Telecommunications (Russia), inga.posta@mail.ru

Dmitry Kurdybaylo

Russian Christian Academy for Humanities (St. Petersburg, Russia), theoreo@yandex.ru

On the philosophy of language in the writings of Porphyry and Iamblichus

Language: Russian

Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 12.2 (2018) 480–498

Keywords: Porphyry, Letter to Anebo, Iamblichus, On mysteries, Plato, Cratylus, philosophy of language, logos, mysticism, theurgy, ancient philosophy, history of linguistics.

Abstract. Porphyry's “Letter to Anebo” and Iamblichus' “On mysteries” provide a comprehensive list of problems that form a borderline between their approaches to theurgy, to relations between gods and a human soul and to the soul's ascent to the intelligible realm. Linguistic subjects comprise a noticeable part of that list of problems, because at least verbal invocations with strange or incomprehensible words and phrases were one of the most distinct attributes of theurgy. For Porphyry speech is an attribute of lower ontological levels, while gods stay in silence and do not use words. Consequently, the soul's ascent to gods is followed by a rejection of all linguistic phenomena. For Iamblichus the highest ontological level is in the same way attributed with silence, but the ascent of soul can be performed with the help of words and sounds, even and especially if they are “senseless” or incomprehensible. Porphyry accents on rational level of language, claims the possibility of expressing any thought in any language, adheres to conventional theory of names origin in the Aristotelian sense and relates the “correctness of names” to coherence of relations between names to relations between things. Iamblichus, on the contrary, values the suprarational level of language (which may seem to be irrational), denies the possibility of translation without loss of meaning, acknowledges the Establisher of names in the Platonic sense and understands the “correctness of names” as consistency between names and the nature of

things. The conclusion reveals the dependence of linguistic views of Porphyry and Iamblichus on their metaphysics and psychology.

Valeriy Surovtsev

Tomsk State University, surovtssev1964@mail.ru

To lekton in Stoic philosophy and Sinn in G. Frege's semantic theory: the question of their epistemological status

Language: Russian

Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 12.2 (2018) 499–522

Keywords: Stoic logic, to lekton, G. Frege, Sinn, semantic theory, axiōma, Gedanke, comparative studies, ancient and contemporary logic, epistemological status.

Abstract. The article deals with the comparative analyses of the Stoic category *to lekton* and G. Frege's category *Sinn*. This essay explicates some formal features of these categories, which demonstrate certain similarities between the Stoic and Fregean logical theories. It is demonstrated that the concept of the complete *lekton* (axiōma) in the Stoic doctrine has the same structure as the concept of thought (*Gedanke*) in Fregean semantic theory. However, the formal structural similarity between these concepts does not presupposes the doctrinal similarity of these categories from the point of view of their epistemological status.

Sergey Avanesov

Tomsk State Pedagogical University, iskiteam@yandex.ru

The Body and the Yarn. A visualization of a metaphor in the Annunciation Iconography

Language: Russian

Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 12.2 (2018) 523–534

Keywords: iconography, Christian literature and art, metaphoric meaning.

Abstract. In this article, I show the semantic connection between one pictorial detail of the traditional Annunciation iconography in Christianity and an apocryphal detail of the Virgin Mary biography, dating back to the antique metaphor of the body as clothing or cloth. In the Annunciation scene, the archangel Gabriel and the Mother of God are present, while the Virgin is often depicted with a spindle and a purple yarn in her hands. This detail sends the viewer to the metaphor of birth as the creation of flesh and blood, as the spinning of the body in the womb of the mother, and also symbolically means the entry of God into the corporeal world through the Virgin and the blood sacrifice offered for the salvation of the world. The described “apocryphal” detail of the Annunciation scene can be understood as a visualization of the metaphor, known in antiquity, of the body creation as spinning or weaving.

Evgenii Derzhivitskij

Saint-Petersburg State University (Russia), derzhiv@mail.ru

Vadim Perov

Saint-Petersburg State University (Russia), vadimperov@gmail.com

Imperative *bona fides* and the problems of invective in the political struggle of late Roman Republic

Language: Russian

Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 12.2 (2018) 535–550

Keywords: conscientiousness, pietas, trust, virtues, moral, civic virtue.

Abstract. The article is devoted to the ethical aspects of political struggle in late Roman Republic, when the genre of invective has become very widespread, becoming an ordinary part of public discussions. Gaius Sallustius Crispus, Markus Tullius Cicero and other prominent politicians in their invectives mutually insulted each other, trying to present their political opponents as absolutely immoral subjects. There were accusations not only of political insolvency, all sides of the private life of opponents were exposed. The authors of the article argue that this practice was based on a specific understanding of virtuous life in Roman society, which existed as a kind of synthesis of private and public morality. An analysis of the characteristic features of social life of this period made it possible to reveal the important role of the concept of conscientiousness (*bona fides*), which can be regarded as an analogue of conscience that arose in later Christianity. It is conscientiousness that established a link between the veneration of relatives (*pietas*), which arose within the framework of personal family moral relations, and socially significant civil virtues. As a result, the veneration penetrated into public relations, and civic virtue turned into moral characteristics of the person. Conscientiousness was the basis both for the formation of personal trust, and for the existence of the Roman state (*res publica*). The authors of the article show that these factors contributed to the wide dissemination of invective, in which the statement of immoral qualities of an opponent aimed not only at discrediting him as a person, but also at destroying his reputation as a public figure, which ensured the winner in the debate the victory in the political struggle.

Vitaly Tselishchev

Novosibirsk State University, Institute of Philosophy and Law, Novosibirsk, Russia, leitval@gmail.com

Pyrrhonian skepticism and Gödel's Second incompleteness theorem

Language: Russian

Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 12.2 (2018) 550–560

Keywords: Sextus Empiricus, isostheneia, Gödel, Second incompleteness theorem, consistency, metamathematics, intensionality.

Abstract. The article compares the Pyrrhonian skepticism with the interpretations of Gödel's Second Theorem as a skeptical challenge in modern mathematics. It is shown that the epistemological framework of Gödel's restrictive theorems fits into the skeptical reflection scheme of Sextus Empiricus.

Denis Maslov

Institute of Philosophy and Law, SB RAS, denn.maslov@gmail.com

Ataraxia in Pyrrhonism

Language: Russian

Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 12.2 (2018) 561–568

Keywords: ataraxia, Pyrrhonism, Sextus Empiricus, quietism, apraxia argument.

Abstract. The paper aims to explicate the notion “ataraxia” in light of its untenable, as I argue, interpretation by M. Gabriel. This philosopher presupposes ataraxia as a total quietism and draws a conclusion, undesirable for Sextus, that the skeptical program of attaining the happiness, which is defined by Sextus as soul tranquility, is inconsistent since the sceptic can never be happy in virtue of incompatibility of inactivity with the skeptical investigation. The first part of the paper conveys the role of *ataraxia* in Sextus’ Pyrrhonism as it is interpreted by Gabriel. In the second part, we come to define ataraxia not as a total quietism (as in Gabriel), but as a suspension of all judgments and a freedom of all distress.

Valery V. Petroff

RAS Institute of Philosophy (Moscow), campos.iph@gmail.com

Appropriation of foreign learning in Ancient and Medieval Latin tradition

Language: Russian

Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 12.2 (2018) 569–581

Keywords: *translatio studii*, *translatio imperii*, appropriation of knowledge, Cicero, Horace, Boethius, Alcuin, John Scottus Eriugena, Heiric of Auxerre.

Abstract. The article gives a brief overview of ancient and medieval programs that aimed to appropriate and transfer the legacy and scholarship from previous cultures. We consider the attitudes of Roman intellectuals towards the translation practices. The rendering of the authoritative works from Greek into Latin was not supposed to result in the exact communication of the contents and meaning of a foreign text by means of the Latin language and not the accurate reproduction of the original text, but the creation of a Latin equivalent that had to replace and even eliminate the original work. In this case, the “translation” was deliberately “adapted”: it incorporated translator’s commentaries and digressions of every kind; it also reflected the mentality and worldview of Roman readers. The practices of appropriating the legacy of the previous culture were formulated in terms of “capture”, “military booty” and “expropriation”. We observe in greater details the relevant arguments of Cicero, Horace, and Boethius and, with reference to the periods of cultural revival in the Middle Ages, excerpts from Alcuin, John Scottus Eriugena, and Heiric of Auxerre.

Nadezhda Volkova

RAS Institute of Philosophy (Moscow), goznadya@gmail.com

Plotinus’ two theodicies

Language: Russian

Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 12.2 (2018) 582–598

Key words: Plato, Plutarch, Plotinus, theodicy, evil, matter, freedom of will, sin.

Abstract. The main subject of the study is the problem of theodicy in the philosophy of Plotinus. In the texts devoted to the problem of evil and theodicy, Plotinus argued against two types of evil – the evil in itself, or the first matter, and evil as an accidental property, among which is the sin of the soul. The first and second series of arguments represent two different versions of theodicy, which have already been previously represented in Platonism – in Plato and Plutarch. However, Plotinus' arguments are of great strength, since they work within the framework of an integral monistic doctrine.

Svetlana Mesyats

RAS Institute of Philosophy (Moscow), messyats@mail.ru

Proclus on hypercosmic souls

Language: Russian

Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 12.2 (2018) 599–631

Keywords: Neoplatonism, Proclus' metaphysical system, divine henads, Proclus' doctrine of soul, ancient commentaries on *Timaeus*.

Abstract. According to Marinus of Samaria, Proclus was the author of many philosophical doctrines. In particular he was the first to assert the existence of a kind of souls (ψυχῶν γένος) that are capable of simultaneously seeing several ideas and situated between the divine Intellect which embraces all things together by a single intuition, and the souls whose thoughts pass from one idea to another. In the following we are going to answer the question, what kind of souls did Proclus discover and why did he thought it to be necessary to introduce them in his metaphysical system. To solve this problem it seems reasonable to clarify the mechanism of horizontal-vertical progression in Proclus' philosophy, as well as to describe the general structure of the psychic level of reality embracing the so called Monad of “unparticipated” Soul and the multiplicity if its “participated” products: divine, demonic and human souls. Unlike some previous scholars, who alleged that souls discovered by Proclus were demonic or intelligent ones, I affirm that Marinus could have in mind hypercosmic participated souls, situated between the unparticipated monad of the psychic level of reality and the multiplicity of participated souls within the material cosmos. In support of this assumption I cite some relevant passages from Proclus' *Commentary on “Timaeus”* and demonstrate that he named “hypercosmic” not only the unparticipated monad of Soul, but also souls of the so called “absolute” (ἀπόλυτοι) gods, which are both in touch with the sensible cosmos and above it because of animating eternal immaterial bodies consisting of supra-celestial light. In conclusion I try to establish the genuine authorship of the doctrine of hypercosmic souls and to answer the question, why did Marinus attribute it to Proclus.

Alexander Sanzhenakov

Institute of Philosophy and Law SB RAS, Novosibirsk, Russia, sanzhenakov@gmail.com

Neostoicism of Justus Lipsius and the History of philosophy in Late Renaissance

Language: Russian

Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 12.2 (2018) 632–642

Keywords: Justus Lipsius, Stoics, Seneca, Neostoicism, history of philosophy.

Abstract. The paper is considering Justus Lipsius' the history of philosophy works. I distinguish the main ideas of Neostoic work "On Constancy" (1584) and show what kind of confusions Lipsius confronted when he was trying to transport some Stoic dogmas on the Christian ground. The main part of this paper pays special attention to the late works of Lipsius – the "Guide of Stoic Philosophy" and the "Physics of the Stoics" (1604), in which he reveals a deeper knowledge of Stoic dogmatics. Analyzing these writings, I show the specifics of the historical approach of Lipsius. It is shown that Lipsius did not follow Seneca's theses all the times, but considered it possible to correct them in order to bring some of them in line with the Christian dogmatism. For this purpose, he was appealing to the Christian (e.g. St. Augustine) and proto-Christian (e.g. Plato) authors. In conclusion I try to argue that we should consider these appeals as an attempt to actualize the Stoic idea in new intellectual context, which is the task of any historian of philosophy.

Roman Svetlov

A. I. Herzen State Pedagogical University, St. Petersburg, Russia, spatha@mail.ru

Elena Alymova

St. Petersburg State University

The Concept of Natural Law: from Plato to Philo

Language: Russian

Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 12.2 (2018) 643–658

Keywords: Plato's doctrine of Politics and Law, Cicero's Philosophy of Law, Natural and Positive Law.

Abstract. It is traditionally considered that the ideas relevant to the concept of Natural Law were for the first time articulated in the polemic of Socrates/Plato against the sophistic doctrine of Conventional Law. But Plato was engaged in arguments not only with the Sophists – he also struggled against indefinite, in many respects antinomic, unreflective ideas of law expressed by average Athenians whereby Law and Power, Law and Status were confused. Plato's appeal to the mythological narrative in the places where he discusses the theme of Natural Law makes it clear that even to his mind the concept of Universal Legislation shows its heterogeneous and problematic character. We argue that Carneades' opposition of Natural and Positive Laws owes precisely to this problem. Cicero inherited this strategy and made it even more radical. His preaching of the idea of natural Law (in its Stoic version) becomes in his texts rhetorical *topos*, which was well known to the readers. Nevertheless Cicero expresses doubts about that simple scheme according to which Positive Law appears a specific representation of Natural Law and tries to trace particular causes, which motivated the concrete forms of positive Law.

Igor Berestov

Institute of Philosophy and Law SB RAS, Russia, berestoviv@yandex.ru

Andrey Tikhonov

Southern Federal University, Russia, equilibre2003@yandex.ru

The Logical Structure of the Epicurean Objection to Sceptics from *Adv. Math.* VIII, 337

Language: Russian

Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 12.2 (2018) 659–668

Keywords: abstract objects, epistemic operators, semantic holism, intentional identity.

Abstract. In this article we are offering a method of analysis and formalization of the Epicurean objection to the Skeptics from the *Adversus mathematicos* VIII, 337, 6-9. We emphasize the importance of this objection for understanding Sextus Empiricus' response to it, continuously discussed by the historians of philosophy. The Epicureans argue that the Skeptics cannot criticize their proof, because when the Skeptics are criticizing their proof, they think something different from the original proof, so that the original proof remains untouchable by any criticism. We explain in which sense the holistic assumption used by Sextus Empiricus and some philosophers before him can be used in the Epicurean objection to the Skeptics. In the final formalization we show that Epicureans' argument can be interpreted as logically correct and deduced from sound premises. In the course of arguing for this thesis we are using the technical means of contemporary epistemic logic.

Pavel Butakov

Institute of Philosophy and Law SB RAS, pavelbutakov@academ.org

Plato, Evidentialism, and JTB

Language: Russian

Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 12.2 (2018) 669–685

Keywords: Plato, knowledge, belief, Gettier, justified true belief, evidence, evidentialism.

Abstract. It is often claimed that Plato's definition of knowledge as "true opinion with an account" is in agreement with the contemporary analysis of knowledge as "justified true belief" (JTB). Some scholars disagree with the attribution of JTB to Plato. I analyze three influential arguments against the assumption of Plato's agreement with JTB, and refute them. Then I provide my own argument against the assumption. I argue that the contemporary interpretation of the JTB formula understands "belief" not in the sense of an "opinion," but rather of a "degree of confidence." Accordingly, "justification" is understood not as applying to the opinion itself, but rather to the person having a certain degree of confidence. I support this claim by showing the difference between the traditional and the contemporary understanding of "evidence," the former referring to a property of the proposition, while the latter meaning the body of reasons, which supports the person's confidence to a certain degree. Thus, I conclude that Plato understands knowledge as "correct opinion validated by a rational explanation," and it has very little in common with the contemporary understanding of knowledge as "sufficiently supported subjective degree of confidence in the truth of a proposition."

Eugene Afonasin

Institute of philosophy and law (Novosibirsk, Russia), afonasin@gmail.com

Heraclides of Pontus and philosophical biography

Language: Russian

Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 12.2 (2018) 686–696

Keywords: ancient biography, doxography, the seven sages, dialogues, Pythagoras, Plato, Academy, Empedocles.

Abstract. Aristotle and his followers, such as Aristoxenus and Dicaearchus, present Pythagoras, the Pythagoreans and Empedocles as figures not entirely devoid of legendary features. At the same time the Peripatetic biographers do not fail to place them in proper historical setting as intellectuals, initiated important philosophical and religious movements. According to Dicaearchus, for instance, the sages are known for their highly practical maxims and general rules of right conduct; Pythagoras developed a new lifestyle and promulgated it in his public and private teaching; Socrates introduced a new form of intellectual and moral pursuit; while Plato founded an institutional framework for philosophical studies having thus paved the way to a systematic research, conducted by the Peripatetics, etc. In a striking contrast with this, in the dialogues of their contemporary Heraclides of Pontus Pythagoras, Empedocles and other ancient philosophers are predominantly literary figures and super-heroes whose supernatural powers are clearly beyond the reach of ordinary men. At the same time, the theories these fictitious personages profess are tailored according to a recognizably Platonic draft. In this work the present writer continues his studies of ancient biographic tradition initiated in a series of articles, published in two previous issues of the journal [*Schole* 10 (2016) 271–282 and 11 (2017) 570–607].

Eugene Afonasin, a translation into Russian, commentaries

Institute of philosophy and law (Novosibirsk, Russia), afonasin@gmail.com

Heraclides of Pontus. Fragments and Testimonia (*On diseases, or the one without breath* (*Apnous*), fr. 82–95 Schütrumpf)

Language: Russian

Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 12.2 (2018) 697–704

Keywords: ancient biography, dialogues, Pythagoras, Empedocles.

Abstract. Heraclides of Pontus (c. 388–310 BCE), a Platonic philosopher, worked in various literary genres, esp. dialogue. He discussed such typical Platonic topics as the transmigration of the soul, composed philosophical lives, dialogues or treatises about politics, literature, history, geography, etc., and wrote a series of works on astronomy and the philosophy of nature. Nothing is preserved. The present publication contains a collection of the testimonies about Heraclides' lost dialogue *On diseases, or the one without breath* (*Apnous*). The evidences are translated and numbered according to a new edition by Schütrumpf et al. 2008.

Yuriy Romanenko

St. Petersburg State University, yr_romanenko@rambler.ru

An imaginative history of Ancient philosophy

Language: Russian

Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 12.2 (2018) 705–708

Keywords: philosophy, history, antiquity, art, iconography, image, imagination.

Abstract. A review of: Dorofeev, D.Yu., Savchuk, V.V., Svetlov, R.V. *Iconography of Ancient Philosophers: the History and Anthropology of Images*. St. Petersburg: Plato's Philosophical Society, 2017. – 244 pp., with ill.

Anton Didikin

Tomsk State University, Institute of Philosophy and Law (Novosibirsk, Russia), abdidikin@bk.ru

Platonism and Normativism: a historical and philosophical reconstruction

Language: Russian

Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 12.2 (2018) 709–713

Keywords: Plato, Platonism, Normativism, metaphysics, ethic, politics, philosophy of law.

Abstract. In a short note, the author outlines a series of Hans Kelsen's studies dedicated to Ancient political thought, esp. his *Platonic Justice*. He believes that these relatively neglected minor studies of the famous philosopher of law could still be of interest to contemporary classicists and the historians of philosophy.

Boris Markov

Saint-Petersburg State University, Russia, b.markov@spbu.ru

Philosophy face to face. Public and private space of ancient culture

Language: Russian

Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 12.2 (2018) 714–720

Keywords: Identity, individual, body, soul, communication, speech, writing, friendship, polis, ethos.

Abstract. Reflections on the book: D. Y. Dorofeev. *Personality and communication. Anthropology of oral and written words in ancient culture*. St. Petersburg: RHGA, 2015. – 639 p.

Anna Afonasina

Novosibirsk State University, Russia, afonasina@gmail.com

Cosmology and Politics in Plato's Later Works

Language: Russian

Issue: ΣΧΟΛΗ 12.2 (2018) 721–734

Keywords: Plato, dialogues, the *Timaeus*, the *Laws*, the *Statesman*.

Abstract. Reflections on the book: O'Meara, D. *Cosmology and politics in Plato's later works*. Cambridge, 2017. – 157 p.

