

TE X N H
**THEORETICAL FOUNDATIONS OF ARTS,
SCIENCES AND TECHNOLOGY
IN THE GRECO-ROMAN WORLD**

Organized by
**THE CENTRE FOR ANCIENT PHILOSOPHY AND THE CLASSICAL TRADITION
NOVOSIBIRSK STATE UNIVERSITY**
Supported by THE OPEN SOCIETY INSTITUTE
WWW.NSU.RU/CLASSICS/

Summer Session
(May 29 – June 7, 2013, Academgorodok, Novosibirsk)

OUTLINE OF THE COURSES AND RECOMMENDED READINGS

Thomas Robinson (The University of Toronto)

Still relevant? Three Greek philosophers on the nature of the cosmos

1. Parmenides and Democritus

This lecture will discuss the closed-system model of the cosmos espoused by Parmenides and the open-system model espoused by the atomists, and the remarkable ‘extrapolative imaginativeness’ underlying both systems. It will also touch on the innocent-looking but (in terms of its possible theological implications) critical question of whether the universe can be said to be itself a physical object on an ontological par with the physical objects composing it.

2. Plato

This lecture will discuss the closed-system model of the universe adopted by Plato, and the specific relevance of his view that Space *moves* to a major feature of contemporary Big Bang theory. It will also talk about his own commitment to the view that the universe *is* a physical object, and the theological conclusions he thinks can be inferred from this.

Primary reading material

- Lecture one
Parmenides frs. 2, 3, 6, 8 DK
Melissus frs. 2-5 DK
Leucippus fr. 2 DK, with *testimonia* DK 67 A 1; 24; DK 68 A 40
Democritus frs. 164, 167 DK, with *testimonia* DK 68 A 40; Diogenes Laertius 9. 45

- Lecture two

Plato, *Timaeus* 27d-29d, 47e-55c

Plato, *Statesman* 269b-270b.

Some literature

Algra, Keimpe, *Concepts of Space in Greek Thought* (Leiden: Brill, 1995)

Brisson, Luc and F. Walter Meyerstein, *Inventing the Universe* (Albany, NY: SUNY Press, 1995)

Cornford, Francis MacDonald, *Plato's Cosmology* (London 1937)

Curd, Patricia, *The Legacy of Parmenides* (Princeton: University Press, 1998)

Johansen, Thomas Kjeller, *Plato's Natural Philosophy* (Cambridge: University Press, 2004)

Sorabji, Richard, *Matter, Space, and Motion: Theories in Antiquity and their Sequel* (London: Duckworth, 1988)

Taylor, A. E., *A Commentary on Plato's Timaeus* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1928)

Taylor, C. C. W., *The Atomists Leucippus and Democritus: Fragments. A Text and Commentary* (Toronto: University Press, 1999)

Dominic O'Meara (Fribourg University)

Cosmology and Politics in Plato's later Works

[N.B.: the passages given below will also sometimes be used in sessions following the session where they are first listed]

1. Seminar session 1: The Literary background of Plato's *Timaeus*.

In this session we will examine the literary genre and organization of the *Timaeus*, the relation between Timaeus' speech about the making of the world-order and the speeches described as coming before (Socrates) and after it (Critias and Hermocrates), and the figure of the 'demiurge', the world-maker, in Timaeus' speech.

Read: *Timaeus* 17b, 20b-21a, 28a-30d, 90d

Seminar session 2: The Model of the World.

This session will deal with the model which the demiurge uses in making the *cosmos*: What is this model? What does it contain? How does it function as a model imitated by the demiurge in making world-order?

Read: *Timaeus* 30b-c, 40a

2. Public Lecture: "The Beauty of the World in Plato's *Timaeus*"

In this lecture I will discuss what it is that makes this world the most beautiful of worlds, according to Plato's *Timaeus*. The relation between goodness and beauty will be examined, as well as the way in which a most perfect model of the world is realized in the world.

Read: *Philebus* 64b-e, 66a-b; *Timaeus* 31c-32a, 87c-d

3. Public Lecture: "Political Science as Weaving in Plato's *Statesman*"

Plato compares political science to weaving a fabric in one of his last works, the *Statesman*. In this lecture I would like to examine this comparison: why does Plato compare political science to weaving? What does this comparison say about what he thinks political science is, its relation to philosophy and to other sciences?

Read: *Statesman* 279a-281c, 309b-311c

4. Seminar session 3: The order of the good city-state in Plato's *Laws*

In this session we will look at the organization of the good city-state proposed by Plato in his *Laws*. We will try in particular to relate this order to that of the world as described in the *Timaeus*.

Read: *Laws* 628c, 739c-e, 741a-b, 745e-746d, 757a-d, 962a-b

Reading session

A selection of passages from the *Timaeus* will be examined as a way of exploring further ideas encountered above in sessions 1 & 2 and in the lecture.

Michael Chase (Paris, CRNS)

Studies in Philosophical Consolation

1. Einstein and the Plotiniana Arabica

Recently, I've become interested in ancient parallels to the current debate in the philosophy of time, between advocates of the so-called block universe view, otherwise known as eternalists, and those, known as presentists, who defend the reality of the passage of time and of its division into past, present and future. I sketch the origin of this idea in the theories of Albert Einstein, then compare it with a manifestation of a similar idea, first in Plotinus and then in the Medieval Arabic adaptation of the Enneads that circulated under the title of the Theology of Aristotle.

2. Boethius on time, eternity, and philosophy as a way of life

I argue that Boethius' *Consolation* is an excellent example of the ancient conception of philosophy as therapy for the soul: as such, it uses both rhetorical techniques and rational arguments in a way that echoes the progressive nature of the Neoplatonic philosophical curriculum. In the second part of this paper, I'll discuss the three arguments Boethius uses to try to resolve the apparent conflict between divine prescience and human free will, paying particular attention to the way he mobilizes Neoplatonic definitions of time and eternity.

Further reading:

On Plotinus:

Plotinus: Gerson, Lloyd, "Plotinus", *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (Fall 2012 Edition), Edward N. Zalta (ed.), URL = <http://plato.stanford.edu/archives/fall2012/entries/plotinus/>

Stephen MacKenna's translation of Plotinus' Enneads is available at <http://classics.mit.edu/Browse/browse-Plotinus.html>

The best discussion of time and eternity in Plotinus is still

Werner Beierwaltes, PLOTIN. Über Ewigkeit und Zeit (Enneade III 7). Übersetzt, eingeleitet und kommentiert, Frankfurt (Klostermann) 1967, 4.Aufl. 1995.

See also Andrew Smith, "Eternity and Time" in Gerson, ed., *The Cambridge Companion to Plotinus*, Cambridge 196, p. 196-216

On time in contemporary philosophy of science:

Barbour, Julian, *The end of time. The next revolution in Physics*, Oxford: OUP, 1999

D'Amour, Thibault, *Si Einstein m'était conté. De la relativité à la théorie des cordes*, Paris: Cherche-Midi 2012² (1st ed. 2005) (Collection Documents)

Davies, Paul, *About time. Einstein's unfinished revolution*, New York: Orion Publications, 1995.

Greene, Brian, *The Fabric of the cosmos. Space, time, and the texture of reality*, New York: Vintage Books, 2004.

Lockwood, Michael, *The Labyrinth of time. Introducing the universe*, Oxford : OUP, 2005.

Price, Huw, *Time's arrow and Archimedes' point. New directions of the physics of time*, New York-Oxford: OUP, 1996.

Rovelli, Carlo, *Et si le temps n'existait pas? Un peu de science subversive*, Paris: Dunod, 2012.

On Boethius:

Boethius's Latin with commentary by Jim O'Donnell and an old English translation is available online at <http://www9.georgetown.edu/faculty/jod/>; the Loeb translation of the Consolation can be found at <http://archive.org/details/theologicaltract00boetuoft>.

Secondary literature:

Chadwick, Henry, *Boethius: The Consolations of Music, Logic, Theology, and Philosophy*, Oxford/New York, 1981.

Marenbon, John, ed., *The Cambridge companion to Boethius*, Cambridge/New York: Cambridge University Pr., 2009. (Cambridge companions to philosophy).

_____, *Boethius*, New York: Oxford University Press, 2003.

Sorabji, Richard, *Time, creation and the continuum*, Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1983, 253-267.

_____, ed., *The philosophy of the commentators, 200-600 AD. 400 years of transition: a sourcebook*, London: Duckworth, 2004. 3 vol.

Teun Tieleman (Utrecht University)

Sextus and the Skeptical Tradition

The skeptical tradition is found at the heart of ancient epistemology. The key texts are Cicero's *Academic Books*, Sextus Empiricus' *Outlines of Pyrrhonism* and *Against the Mathematicians*, as well as Augustine's *Against the Academicians*. Key questions include: What was the exact nature and motivation of ancient Skepticism? What constitutes the difference between its two ancient varieties, Academic Skepticism and (Neo-)Pyrrhonism? And what characterizes ancient

Skepticism as compared to modern varieties since Descartes? What was the relation between Skepticism and other philosophical schools and between Skepticism and common morality and religion? Although I will deal to a greater or lesser extent with most of these questions, my main focus will be on Pyrrhonist Scepticism as represented by Sextus. I will further illustrate his position by examining the attack he launched against the concept central to our programme—art (têchnê).

The titles of classes:

1. Sextus Empiricus and Pyrrhonism.
2. TEXNH Contested: Sextus Empiricus on the Arts.

Primary sources:

Sextus Empiricus, *Adversus Mathematicos (M) Pyrrhoniae hypotyposes (PH)*

Sextus Empiricus, *Opera*, ed. H. Mutschmann and J. Mau, 4 vols. (Leipzig: Teubner, 1954–1956).

Bett R., tr., *Sextus Empiricus, Against the Ethicists* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1997); *Against the Logicians* (Cambridge: University Press, 2005).

Sextus Empiricus, *Outlines of Scepticism*, ed. and trans. Julia Annas and Jonathan Barnes (Cambridge: University Press, 2000).

Mates B., tr., *The Sceptic Way: Sextus Empiricus' Outlines of Pyrrhonism* (Oxford: University Press, 1996).

Секст Эмпирик, *Сочинения в 2-х тт.*, под ред А. Ф. Лосева (М., 1976).

Long, A. (1974) *Hellenistic Philosophy: Stoics, Epicureans, Sceptics* (London: Duckworth). Reprinted with updated bibliography by University of California Press, 1986.

Eugene Afonasin (ed.) *Ancient Scepticism. A short introduction and anthology of the Greek and Latin texts with a Russian translation.* 2011:

<http://www.nsu.ru/classics/bibliotheca/Latin-anthology.pdf>

Readings

Bett, Richard (ed.). *The Cambridge companion to ancient skepticism.* Cambridge; New York: Cambridge University Press, 2010.

Hankinson, R. (1995) *The Sceptics* (London: Routledge, 1995).

Janáček, K. (2008) *Studien zu Sextus Empiricus, Diogenes Laertius und zur pyrrhonischen Skepsis*, J. Janda and F. Karfik, eds. (Berlin / New York: de Gruyter).

Perin, C. (2010) *The Demands of Reason: An Essay on Pyrrhonian Scepticism* (Oxford: University Press).

Tieleman, T. “The Art of Life: An Ancient Idea and Its Survival”, *ΣΧΟΛΗ* 2 (2008) 245-252.

Liliane Karali-Giannakopoulou (The University of Athens)

**Genesis of Art in South Eastern Mediterranean:
Cultural achievements, Technology , Symbolism**

- **Genesis of arts. The theoretical background .The dawn of art as it appears in the four major Geographical areas :**

- **Western Europe, Middle East and the Balkan Peninsula**
- **Stone Age: The Paleolithic period; The Neolithic period**
- **From the beginnings to the end of Bronze Age. The dawn of western art as it appears in four Greek civilizations :**
 - **Cycladic , Minoan**
 - **Helladic and Mycenaean**
- **Genesis of arts: The theoretical background; Stone Age**
 - This session begins with the definition of the meanings of the term "ART" as conceived and documented by the first archaeologists of the 18th century to its variations and transformations of nowadays. The genesis of art will be briefly presented and discussed from the point of view of archaeologists and art historians, in specific geographic areas and chronological periods, beginning with the earliest examples dating from the Lower Paleolithic period to the end of the Mesolithic in the following geographical areas: Western Europe, Middle East and the Balkan Peninsula.
 - In this session will be displayed and discussed some of the major archaeological findings and achievements of the Neolithic Period in the Middle East, the Balkan Peninsula and Western Europe. The presentation will close with a comparative study and general remarks on the concepts and the meaning of the Stone Age Art.

3) Bronze Age: The case of prehistoric Greece; Cycladic and Minoan civilizations.

- Session 3 deals with the art developed during Bronze Age in the broader Aegean area, produced by the inhabitants of the Cyclades in the Early Bronze Age and the Minoan civilization that arose in the island of Crete and flourished during the Middle-Late Bronze Age.

4) Late Bronze Age: Helladic and Mycenaean civilization.

- In the last session the Bronze Age civilizations of mainland Greece will be displayed and discussed with emphasis on the appearance and establishment of the Mycenaean civilization during the Late Bronze Age period. The presentation will close with a comparative study and general remarks on the innovations, traditions, concepts and the meaning of Art in Prehistory, as well as their continuities and discontinuities in the historical periods.

Selected Bibliography

- Bahn, P. (1997), *The Cambridge illustrated history of Prehistoric art*. United Kingdom: Cambridge University Press.
- Bailey, D.W. (2000), *Balkan prehistory: Exclusion, Incorporation and Identity*, London: Routledge.
- Barrett, J. and Halstead, P. (ed.) (2004), *The Emergence of Civilization Revisited*, Oxford.
- Bourriau, J.C.J. and Phillips, J. (ed.) (2004), *Invention and Innovation: the social context of technological change. Egypt, the Aegean and the Near East, 1650-1150 BC*, vol.2, Oxford: Oxbow Books.
- Camps, G. (1998), 'Le Néolithique méditerranéen : techniques et genres de vie', *Encyclopédie de la Méditerranée*, vol.12, Paris : Edisud.
- Cauvin, J. (1997), *Naissance des divinités. Naissance de l'agriculture. La révolution des symboles au Néolithique*, Paris : CNRS.
- Davis, J.L. (1992), 'Review of Aegean Prehistory I : The Islands of the Aegean', *AJA* 96, pp.699-756.
- Davis, J.L. (2001), 'The Islands of the Aegean', in Cullen, T. (ed.) *Aegean Prehistory : A Review*, Boston, pp.19-76.
- Day, L.P., Mook, M.S. and Muhly, J.D. (ed.) (2004), 'Crete Beyond the Palaces', *Proceedings of the Crete 2000 Conference*, Philadelphia.
- De Lumley, H. (1998), *L'Homme premier : préhistoire, évolution, culture*, Paris: Editions Odile Jacob.
- Thomsen, C.J. (1848), *A Guide to Northern Antiquities*, translated by Lord Ellesmere.
- Dickinson, O. (1994), *The Aegean Bronze Age*, United Kingdom: Cambridge University Press.
- Honou, H. and Fleming, J. (1982), *A World History of Art*, London : Macmillan Reference Books.
- Karali, L. (2011), *Neolithic culture: In pursue of the human traces in the Neolithic Environment of the East and the West*. Athens: Institute of the Book - A. Kardamitsa.
- Karali, L. (1998), *Dictionary of Archaeological – Environmental Terms*, 2nd edition, Athens: Hellinika Grammata. (in Greek and English).
- Kozlowski, P. and Van Berg, L. (ed.) (1993), 'Atlas du Néolithique Européen', *Études et Recherches Archéologiques de l'Université de Liège (ERAUL)*, No 45.
- Mohen, J.P. and Taborin, Y. (1998), *Les sociétés de la Préhistoire*, Paris: Coll. Hachette Supérieur.
- Mylonas, G.E. (1966), *Mycenae and the Mycenaean Age*, Princeton.
- Otte, M. (avec les contributions de David-Elbiali M., Éluère C., Mohen J.-P. et Noiret P.), (2002), *La Protohistoire*, 2^e ed., Bruxelles: De Boeck.
- Schliemann, H. (1878), *A Narrative of Researches and Discoveries at Mycenae and Tiryns*, London.
- Treuil, R., Pascal, D., Poursat, J. and Touchais, G., (1989), *Les civilisations égéennes du néolithique et de l'Age du Bronze*, Paris : Presses Universitaires de France.
- Trigger, B.G., (1989), *A History of Archaeological Thought*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Winckelmann, J.J., (1764), *Geschichte Der Kunst Des Alterthums*, Wien : Akademischer Verlag.

Shorter presentations

Olga Kyrillova (Kiev)

Teaching *Techne*. Heidegger and Lacan on Truth and Knowledge

Dmitry Scheglov (Saint Petersburg)

Ptolemaeus' Geography and the "map" by Marcus Vipsanius Agrippa

Svetlana Mesyats (Moscow)

Proclus on the *Timaeus* (esp. In Tim. I, 171 – 176, 30)